

Detective Scott Eelman
*Specializing in Crime Scene Reconstruction,
Evidence Processing and Management*

101 Ironstone Drive
Lititz, PA 17543
(717) 278-3263

**ATTORNEY WORK PRODUCT
PERSONAL AND CONFIDENTIAL**

April 14, 2017

RE: Ellen R. Greenberg (Case #17-001)

INFORMATION:

I was contacted by Dr. Wayne K. Ross who asked that I review a case for him to perform a crime scene reconstruction. Dr. Ross provided the below listed items for my review.

MATERIALS RECEIVED:

1. Autopsy photos
2. Crime scene photos taken by the Philadelphia Medical Examiner's Office
3. Philadelphia Medical Examiner's report
4. Philadelphia Medical Examiner's Office Investigator report
5. Expert report of Dr. Cyril Wecht, M.D.

ANALYSIS OF INFORMATION:

Ellen R. Greenberg was a 27-year-old female found deceased in an apartment she shared with her fiancé, Samuel Goldberg. According to the Medical Examiner's Investigator's report, Mr. Goldberg reported that he left Ms. Greenberg in the apartment by herself when he went to the gym at approximately 1645 hours. He indicated that he returned approximately 30 - 45 minutes later and found the apartment door locked. Mr. Goldberg stated he used his key to attempt entry but found that the security latch had been engaged and he was unable to enter. He waited approximately 1 hour prior to forcing entry to the apartment. Mr. Goldberg indicated an apartment building security person was present at the time he forced entry.

The photographs of the crime scene depict Ms. Greenberg seated on the kitchen floor against the corner cabinet. She is found slumped downward resting on her buttocks and lower back. Her arms are extended parallel to her upper body with both hands rotated slightly inward from the anatomical position. A white in color towel is noted clenched in her left hand which is also extended toward her feet. Her legs are extended with her feet rotated outward. She is wearing a pair of light brown/tan in color Ugg boots, a pair of gray in color sweatpants tucked into the boots, a dark gray in color zip-up sweatshirt and a dark gray in color T-shirt underneath of the sweatshirt. Her head is noted to be turned to the right and tilted slightly forward with her chin resting on her right shoulder and the right side of her head resting against the cabinet face.

The handle of a knife is present protruding from the upper left chest of Ms. Greenberg. Bloodstains are noted on the sweatshirt, sweatpants, boots, hands and face of Ms. Greenberg. Bloodstains are also noted on the floor immediately adjacent to her body and the cabinet faces adjacent to her body. Two large knives are noted in the right side of the double sink. A kitchen knife block is noted on the counter in the corner. The knife block is overturned and two empty spaces are observed. A pair of eyeglasses is noted on the floor near her right hand. A "scrunchy" type elastic hair tie is noted around the right wrist.

The boots show small circular and elliptical bloodstains to the top portion of the foot of the boots; with the left boot displaying a greater number of stains than the right. The left shows circular bloodstains on the upward facing aspects of the boots with the elliptical shaped stains following the contour of the boot along the toe and insole areas and associated satellite stains. The left boot shows only five or six circular and elliptical bloodstains. The circular bloodstains are along the upward facing aspect of the boot with the elliptical shaped stains following the contour of the boot along the insole area. No overt bloodstains are noted to the upper portions of either of the boots or the back of the boots. The sole of the right boot does show some evidence of bloodstains but none of the photographs depict enough of the sole of the boot for thorough evaluation. The sole of the left boot cannot be thoroughly evaluated in these photographs.

The bloodstains on the sweatpants show primarily circular and elliptical shaped bloodstains to the front portions of the upper pant legs. There are no obvious bloodstains noted to the lower pant legs below the knees. The left pant leg shows a larger number of circular bloodstains with associated wicking due to the nature of the cloth material of the sweatpants. The circular bloodstains are larger than those visible on the boots. The right pant leg shows a lesser number of circular bloodstains with associated wicking. Some transfer stains are noted to the anterior portion of the upper pant leg. A void area is noted to the upper leg/lower pelvis area of the sweatpants into the crotch portion of the sweatpants. Circular and elliptical bloodstains are noted covering the outer portions of the anterior hip region of the sweatpants. The lower portion of the gray T-shirt is observed covering the upper portion of the sweatpants. Circular/elliptical shaped bloodstains are noted to the lower margin of the T-shirt in this region. A void area is observed from the upper portion of these bloodstains along the lower margin up to the lower margin of the sweatshirt where it covers the T-shirt. Multiple circular and elliptical bloodstains are noted on the anterior portion of the sweatshirt covering the front pocket area with associated wicking more so in the area of the zipper. Some circular and elliptical bloodstains are noted alongside the zipper above this area in the area of the lower rib margin and epigastric region. Void patterns are noted to the front of the sweatshirt beneath the area of both breasts. Elongated elliptical and flow pattern bloodstains are noted to the upper portion of the sweatshirt overlying both breasts; more so on the right than the left. A void pattern is noted overlying the left upper breast region of the sweatshirt. The cloth along the zipper shows clear wicking of blood from the lower rib margin area continuously to its termination at the top of the sweatshirt. No obvious bloodstains are observed to the left upper shoulder, left arm or the left side of the attached hood of the sweatshirt. Multiple circular and elliptical shaped bloodstains and flow pattern bloodstains are noted to the right upper arm region of the sweatshirt. A few circular and elliptical bloodstains are noted to the right lower sleeve of the sweatshirt.

The floor area to the right of Ms. Greenberg shows a few small circular bloodstains. The towel in her left hand shows only a singular bloodstain to the lower portion and a reddish/pink colored area near her left hand. No obvious bloodstains are noted to her left hand. A singular elliptical shaped bloodstain is noted on a cabinet face to the right of the stove.

The floor surface between the legs of Ms. Greenberg showed numerous circular and elliptical bloodstains between her upper legs. There is also evidence of diluted pooled blood between her upper thighs in the crotch area. Dark staining, presumed to be urine, is noted from the crotch area of the sweatpants and upper thighs. No overt bloodstains are noted between the lower legs. There is a collection of dark colored longer hairs noted on the floor between the lower legs of Ms. Greenberg.

The floor area to the left of Ms. Greenberg's right leg and arm shows several bloodstain patterns. Several small circular bloodstains are noted on the floor in the area of the eyeglasses. The arms of the eyeglasses are extended. The frames are dark in color thus making any determination of bloodstains on the frames

more difficult. There is a reddish/pink colored discoloration noted to the right lens of the eyeglasses which may represent blood. A larger patterned bloodstain is noted between the eyeglasses and Ms. Greenberg right hand. There is also a defined edge noted to the bloodstain. The lower edge of the bloodstained towards Ms. Greenberg's feet shows a defined edge and some diluted/alterd bloodstain.

The cabinet door face beneath the right side of the double sink shows two distinct bloodstain patterns. There are series of five bloodstains in a linear pattern from lower left upper right. Three of these bloodstains are larger in volume than the subsequent two. The angle of these bloodstains is primarily downward at a relatively low angle. The second set of bloodstains is noted in the upper right corner of the cabinet face. These bloodstains have a slight left to right directionality are primarily downward.

The corner cabinet has two faces to the cabinet door. The face beneath the sink side of the counter shows three sets of distinct swipe patterns. The first set is toward the top left corner of the cabinet under the handle and has a horizontal motion toward the corner of the cabinet. The second set appears below into the right of the first and has a more downward motion with slight motion toward the corner the cabinet. The third set is below the first along the leading edge of the cabinet face. It is a lighter swipe pattern and has a horizontal motion. A small transfer pattern is noted between the first and third swipe patterns. The adjacent face of the corner cabinet on the stove side of the counter shows several smaller transfer type bloodstains. The available set of photographs is not sufficient for a determination on whether these are swipe patterns or simply transfer.

The bloodstains to her face show primarily flow patterns and transfer patterns. A significant flow pattern stain is noted emanating from her upper right forehead, diagonally across her forehead to the left eyebrow region. A second set of flow patterns appears to originate from the corner of her left eye. The first branch of this flow pattern flows downward alongside of the left side of her nose and terminates under her left nares. The second branch of this flow pattern moves across the lower aspect of her left cheekbone where it appears to pool or at least spread out and moves downward. It diverges into two branches; the first of which terminates at the left corner of the mouth and the second appears to terminate just lateral to this. The third branch flows from the left cheekbone lateral to the first two, flows downward just lateral to the left corner of her mouth and down to the left side of her chin. Another branch from the wider area along her left cheekbone moves rearward toward her ear and slightly upward. Yet another branch moves rearward toward her ear, slightly further than the previous branch, and then moves slightly upward. Another branch moves from her left cheekbone laterally and slightly downward toward the corner of her jaw and into her hairline below and behind her left ear. A large area of bloodstain is noted on the upper portion of the bridge of her nose between her eyes. Bloodstains are observed to the right side of the face as well but these photographs fail to clearly depict this area enough for a thorough analysis.

The photographs from the front door are reviewed. There is damage noted to the door side of the security latch which is still attached to the door. The screws are still present in the screw hole. The doorjamb side of the security latch does not appear to show any damage. The floor underneath the door area, while it is difficult to see with the photographs given, does not show any evidence of debris from the damaged security latch.

No photographs were received of the refrigerator, kitchen pantry/closet or any portion of that wall between the kitchen and the front door. No photographs are received of the ceiling of the kitchen area. No photographs are received of Mr. Goldberg, his footwear or his clothing.

The autopsy report from the Philadelphia Medical Examiner's Office concludes that Ms. Greenberg suffered eight stab wounds to her chest, one stab wound to her abdomen, and incised wound to her scalp and 10 stab wounds to her posterior neck.

FINDINGS AND OPINIONS:

1. Ms. Greenberg died as a result of stab wounds to the back of her neck, abdomen and chest. A significant incised wound was also noted to the back of the right side of her scalp.

2. Is Greenberg was found in the corner of the kitchen area of the apartment between the sink and the stove. Her back was leaning against the corner cabinet, she was slumped downward with her feet and arms extended. A white and colored towel was located in her left hand and was also extended downward toward her feet. Her head was found **to be tilted slightly forward and to the right with her chin resting against her right shoulder and the right lateral portion of her head resting against the face of the corner cabinet.**
3. The bloodstains on her face are inconsistent with the position in which she was found. Specifically the bloodstain flow pattern diagonally across her forehead from the right to the left and terminating in the left eyebrow would move against the law of gravity. This particular flow pattern indicates that her head was tilted slightly backwards and to the left as the origination of that blood occurred in the hairline somewhere above and to the right of the anterior forehead. The blood flow from the medial corner of the left eye has several branches. The branch closest to the nose would be consistent with the position in which she was found. It flows along the left side of the nose and terminates underneath the left nares. The remaining branches of this complex bloodstain do not comport with the position in which she was found. A significant amount of blood flowed from the medial corner of her left eye, moved **across her left cheek and across the surface of a raised cheekbone.** From there, this complex bloodstain has several branches which indicate her head was in different positions as this blood flowed. The first branch, moving medially to laterally, moves down the front of the face just lateral to the left side of the nose and splits into two branches; one of which terminates in the left corner of the mouth and the other terminates just lateral to the left corner of the mouth. The next branch, moving laterally, continues laterally across her cheekbone and then proceeds downward lateral to the second branch, lateral to the left corner of her mouth and proceeds down to the left side of her jawbone between the chin and the corner of the jaw. The next branch, moving laterally, continues from the cheekbone and moves slightly upward toward the eye before terminating. This would indicate that the head was lying back either in a flat or lowered position. The next branch follows the larger stain pattern across the cheekbone and then also moves upward toward the ear before terminating. In a larger, seemingly more significant, flow pattern **bloodstain** moves laterally **across the cheek to the corner of the jaw proceeding rearward into the hairline below and behind the left ear.** This would again move against the flow of gravity given the **position in which the body was found. This bloodstain indicates that her head was intact tilted back or completely flat at the time of this blood flow.**
4. The circular and elliptical bloodstains noted to the sweatshirt indicate the source of the blood is from above this level, most likely the head or neck. These bloodstains are consistent with dropped blood and would indicate that the head of the victim was tilted forward at the time of their deposition. The void patterns in the sweatshirt **comport with this theory** and can be accounted for by folds in the sweatshirt if the **entire body was leaning forward with the head/neck complex leaning forward.** This would also account for the **circular appearing bloodstains** noted to the lower portion of the T-shirt sticking out from under the sweatshirt and the circular bloodstains noted to the upper legs of the sweatpants. The **stains are all consistent with dropped blood. The circular appearing bloodstains on the shirt and the upper pants indicate that the source of the blood was directly over or nearly directly over the pants and shirt where the bloodstains were deposited.** The greater number of circular bloodstains noted to the left upper leg as compared to the right upper leg of the sweatpants **would indicate that the source of the blood would have been concentrated for a longer period of time over the left upper leg.** The lack of bloodstains to the lower legs of the pants coupled with the small circular bloodstains to the tops of the boots would indicate that the lower legs were obstructed from the dropped blood. This would be consistent with Ms. Greenberg being in a seated position, her head leaning forward with her feet flat on the floor. The void patterns to the upper portion of the sweatpants between the waist and the upper legs are also consistent with this theory.
5. **Should Ms. Greenberg have been standing at the time of the blood being dropped onto her upper pants, these bloodstains would be elliptical in nature with some evidence of directionality. One would also expect to find bloodstains on the lower pant legs as well.**

6. While no photographs were provided of the back of Ms. Greenberg's clothing, the blood flow patterns and injuries to the neck would indicate that bloodstains were present to the back of her clothing. While some transfer patterns were observed to the stove side cabinet face of the corner cabinet, there were no significant transfer patterns noted to this area.
7. Swipe patterns noted on the sink side cabinet face of the corner cabinet indicate Ms. Greenberg's bloody hair came in contact with this cabinet face. The first contact was near the opening side of the cabinet face and moved rearward. Her head was then separated from the cabinet face and later recontacted the cabinet face in a lower position than the original contact where it moved backward and slightly downward. No other obvious swipe patterns were noted to the cabinet face. None of these bloodstains accounts for the flow patterns noted to the front of Ms. Greenberg's face.
8. The number and volume of drops noted to her sweatshirt, her sweatpants and her boots is significant. The number of bloodstains on the floor, however, is minimal in comparison to those found on her clothing.
9. The bloodstain noted to the floor between her right hand and the eyeglasses is of particular interest. This bloodstain has a hard edge indicating that there was either an intervening object preventing the flow of blood any further or that the bloodstain was somehow altered. Although it is difficult to discern given the photographs presented, there is an area of pinkish discoloration noted to the lower edge of the bloodstain which may indicate some form of attempt to clean up or other alteration of the bloodstain. There is also a significant pattern noted within the bloodstain itself which may be consistent with the footwear pattern or something else.
10. Though the photographs do not clearly depict the bottoms of Ms. Greenberg's boots, there are some bloodstains evident to the bottom of the right boot. Were the pattern bloodstain to have been made by Ms. Greenberg's boot, one would expect to see other pattern transfer stains on the floor in other locations where she stepped. One would also expect to see a larger bloodstain pattern covering the surface of the sole of her right boot.
11. It is my opinion, that Ms. Greenberg was not in the position in which she was found at the time that the blood was deposited on her sweatpants, sweatshirt and shoes. It is also my opinion that Ms. Greenberg's head had been in several positions during the time of blood flow and it remained so for enough time as to have the blood flow across her face and back toward her ear, upward toward her eyes and also downward toward her chin.
12. It is my opinion that the bloodstain evidence in this case is inconsistent with position in which Ms. Greenberg was found. Furthermore, I have serious concerns regarding the patterned bloodstain to the left of Ms. Greenberg's right leg, the minimal amount of bloodstains on the floor in comparison with those found on the clothing of Ms. Greenberg and the flow patterns of the bloodstains on Ms. Greenberg's face relative to the position in which she was found.

These opinions were formed using the information available at the time of the evaluation and examination. I reserve the right to amend these opinions should further information become available.

Respectfully,

Detective Scott Belman